

A crisis for a few banks is not a banking crisis



March 24, 2023

Global Portfolio Advisory Committee

It's understandable that investors remain scarred by memories of 2008–09 and that any word of bank failures brings fears. But several factors distinguish the current turmoil from the banking system crisis of 2008–09. We discuss the drivers of U.S. policymakers' current approach to today's stress, and the risks for investors in U.S. banks.

Financial turmoil inevitably awakens memories of 2008–09 and the global financial crisis. We believe strongly that the recent events in the U.S. financial system are not the early stages of a 2008 repeat; 15 years ago, we had a banking crisis and today we have a crisis at a few banks. This distinction is critical for investors, in our view.

We see the relative paucity of new measures by U.S. policymakers to date as a reflection of the ultimate manageability of today's issues. But we also believe it could mark a potentially unwise attempt to assign losses between depositors and investors, a move that we see as fraught with potential unintended consequences.

Banking basics

Banking at its core is a relatively simple business. Depositors give an institution savings, and banks invest those savings. Sometimes banks buy existing investments such as U.S. Treasury bonds, and sometimes banks create their own investments by making loans. As long as the bank's investments return more in interest and principal than it owes depositors, the bank is in good shape. Since some borrowers don't pay and some bonds go bad, banks also have money from their owners, referred to as either capital or equity, to cover those losses.

One complication for banks is that depositors can, by and large, withdraw their money at any time, but banks don't always have the same luxury. Borrowers can't be forced to repay a mortgage on demand and bond prices may have temporarily declined. To allow for this, banks always try to keep plenty of cash on hand to meet depositor withdrawals, but they cannot keep it all in cash or they

would not have a way of generating the cash flow to pay interest or dividends to investors.

Past problems

In 2008, banks had a genuine problem. Assets they had carried on their books were worth less (and in some cases worthless) because of extremely lax loan standards that resulted in widespread loan defaults. That created a hole in the banks' capital and some banks were likely technically insolvent; if we added up all the money they would ever receive from their investments, the amount would have been insufficient to pay all the money that the bank owed.

Fixing this type of permanent drop in future income requires capital. Capital is risky, and as a result it's expensive, even in good times. In 2008–09, banks needed someone to replenish money that had already been lost, and that is a particularly difficult request. Ultimately, the government had to step in and provide assistance.

The easy part

Today's issue is not that the expected money from banks' assets will never be received. Many of the assets with the steepest price declines are U.S. Treasuries that we, and all market participants that we are aware of, fully expect to be repaid on time and in full.

The issue today is that more depositors than normal are demanding their cash, driven by fear of bank failure. It's a classic bank run that the existence of the deposit insurance is supposed to avoid.

Investment and insurance products offered through RBC Wealth Management are not insured by the FDIC or any other federal government agency, are not deposits or other obligations of, or guaranteed by, a bank or any bank affiliate, and are subject to investment risks, including possible loss of the principal amount invested.

For important disclosures and author's contact information, see [page 3](#).

Produced: March 24, 2023 1:15 pm ET; Disseminated: March 24, 2023 1:30 pm ET.

There are two ways to deal with a bank run. One is to calm depositors' fears and discourage them from removing money. To a certain extent, that has worked. Much of the money being withdrawn isn't leaving the banking system overall but moving from a few small banks to larger ones. This is not ideal for the long-term health of a competitive banking system, but it is a far cry from 2008's global financial instability. It is also why we think this is a crisis for some banks but not for the banking system.

The other way to deal with a bank run is to find new money for the bank to use. To a large part, that's already happened. The Federal Reserve's new lending facility allows banks to use central bank financing to replace depositor money for certain U.S. Treasury and mortgage bonds. Critically, the Fed allows the banks to fund the bonds at the face value of the investment, meaning that in most cases this is a near seamless transition for depositor funding amounts; it's more expensive, but it's there.

The existing Fed mechanism doesn't work for all types of bank investments. Commercial and individual loans are not homogenous risks like government bonds. But the central bank has plenty of experience in crafting joint solutions for these types of assets with the U.S. Treasury Department, where the Fed provides financing to non-government assets and Treasury absorbs any realized credit losses. Historically, these arrangements have worked to the Fed's and the government's advantage.

Turmoil in European banks could add to the pressure on certain U.S. financial institutions and potentially raise the stakes for the Fed and Treasury. But with asset quality sound and with our view that major European banks are likely to continue to perform on their obligations, we think this remains a problem well within the capacity of the U.S. government.

Moral hazard

Since the current problem should be relatively easy to solve, the obvious question is why have policymakers failed to act more decisively.

We see three reasons. First, existing legal authority to act is murky, at best. The Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation (FDIC) has wide powers to resolve banks in receivership, but absent congressional action it is relatively hamstrung in preventive moves. Second, because the overall system is not in crisis—as noted, large banks have seen deposit inflows—there is less immediate pressure on regulators to push the limits of their authority. Finally, and we believe somewhat hazardously, policymakers, in our view, are willing to see bank failures in part to combat potential moral hazards created by the 2008 bailouts. We think they are using this episode to reinforce that investors in banks—buyers of bonds, preferred shares, and stocks—are at risk if a bank fails.

While this is not necessarily a bad message to send, it is a different message than investors had perhaps believed after 2008. In 2008, we think that investors largely—and reasonably—concluded that investments made in sound financial institutions would be respected in a resolution if the bank later fell as part of an external risk event. A full government guarantee may not have been thought likely, but given the highly regulated nature of the institutions and the key role banks play in the economy, some consideration for investors may have been expected.

We are worried that policymakers may get what they seem to wish for: a sudden repricing of the risks in investing in bank bonds and stocks. If that were to occur, it could make it difficult for some banks—particularly smaller institutions—to borrow sufficient money in the public markets at economically viable rates to support their current levels of lending, let alone the type of loan growth companies have come to rely on. The impacts would likely be felt across the economy but would be especially detrimental for small businesses that rely on local lenders.

For investors, we think it is key to remember that the primary support for any investment is the fundamental underlying business and, broadly speaking, we believe the U.S. banking system's fundamentals remain solid. Even if the goalposts have moved from 2008 on the impact to investors in the case of default, that change does not directly impact investors in institutions that remain in operation. To state it plainly, we think that will be the case for the overwhelming majority of U.S. banks.

Not the end

The 2008–09 global financial crisis was a critical, if not *the* critical, financial event of the century to date. It's understandable that investors remain scarred by the event and that any word of bank failures brings fears. But we believe the underlying causes of the current market upheaval are both less substantial for the banking system and more easily controlled by existing central bank and regulatory mechanisms.

Author

Atul Bhatia, CFA – Minneapolis, United States

atul.bhatia@rbc.com; RBC Capital Markets, LLC

Disclosures and Disclaimer

Analyst Certification

All of the views expressed in this report accurately reflect the personal views of the responsible analyst(s) about any and all of the subject securities or issuers. No part of the compensation of the responsible analyst(s) named herein is, or will be, directly or indirectly, related to the specific recommendations or views expressed by the responsible analyst(s) in this report.

Important Disclosures

In the U.S., RBC Wealth Management operates as a division of RBC Capital Markets, LLC. In Canada, RBC Wealth Management includes, without limitation, RBC Dominion Securities Inc., which is a foreign affiliate of RBC Capital Markets, LLC. This report has been prepared by RBC Capital Markets, LLC which is an indirect wholly-owned subsidiary of the Royal Bank of Canada and, as such, is a related issuer of Royal Bank of Canada.

Non-U.S. Analyst Disclosure

One or more research analysts involved in the preparation of this report (i) may not be registered/qualified as research analysts with the NYSE and/or FINRA and (ii) may not be associated persons of the RBC Wealth Management and therefore may not be subject to FINRA Rule 2241 restrictions on communications with a subject company, public appearances and trading securities held by a research analyst account.

In the event that this is a compendium report (covers six or more companies), RBC Wealth Management may choose to provide important disclosure information by reference. To access current disclosures, clients should refer to <https://www.rbccm.com/GLDisclosure/PublicWeb/DisclosureLookup.aspx?EntityID=2> to view disclosures regarding RBC Wealth Management and its affiliated firms. Such information is also available upon request to RBC Wealth Management Publishing, 250 Nicollet Mall, Suite 1800, Minneapolis, MN 55401-1931.

RBC Capital Markets Distribution of Ratings

For the purpose of ratings distributions, regulatory rules require member firms to assign ratings to one of three rating categories – Buy, Hold/Neutral, or Sell – regardless of a firm’s own rating categories. Although RBC Capital Markets’ ratings of Outperform (O), Sector Perform (SP), and Underperform (U) most closely correspond to Buy, Hold/Neutral and Sell, respectively, the meanings are not the same because RBC Capital Markets ratings are determined on a relative basis.

Distribution of ratings – RBC Capital Markets Equity Research

As of December 31, 2022

Rating	Count	Percent	Investment Banking Services Provided During Past 12 Months	
			Count	Percent
Buy [Outperform]	839	56.05	225	26.82
Hold [Sector Perform]	603	40.28	151	25.04
Sell [Underperform]	55	3.67	3	5.45

Explanation of RBC Capital Markets Equity Rating System

An analyst’s “sector” is the universe of companies for which the analyst provides research coverage. Accordingly, the rating assigned to a particular stock represents solely the analyst’s view of how that stock will perform over the next 12 months relative to the analyst’s sector average.

Ratings: Outperform (O): Expected to materially outperform sector average over 12 months. **Sector Perform (SP):** Returns expected to be in line with sector average over 12 months. **Underperform (U):** Returns expected to be materially below sector average over 12 months. **Restricted (R):** RBC policy precludes certain types of communications, including an investment recommendation, when RBC is acting as an advisor in certain merger or other strategic transactions and in certain other circumstances. **Not Rated (NR):** The rating, price targets and estimates have been removed due to applicable legal, regulatory or policy constraints which may include when RBC Capital Markets is acting in an advisory capacity involving the company.

As of March 31, 2020, RBC Capital Markets discontinued its Top Pick rating. Top Pick rated securities represented an analyst’s best idea in the sector; expected to provide significant absolute returns over 12 months with a favorable risk-reward ratio. Top Pick rated securities have been reassigned to RBC Capital Markets’ Outperform rated securities category, which are securities expected to materially outperform sector average over 12 months.

Risk Rating: The **Speculative** risk rating reflects a security’s lower level of financial or operating predictability, illiquid share trading volumes, high balance sheet leverage, or limited operating history that result in a higher expectation of financial and/or stock price volatility.

Valuation and Risks to Rating and Price Target

When RBC Capital Markets assigns a value to a company in a research report, FINRA Rules and NYSE Rules (as incorporated into the FINRA Rulebook) require that the basis for the valuation and the impediments to obtaining that valuation be described. Where applicable, this information is included in the text of our research in the sections entitled “Valuation” and “Risks to Rating and Price Target”, respectively.

The analyst(s) responsible for preparing this research report have received (or will receive) compensation that is based upon various factors, including total revenues of RBC Capital Markets, and its affiliates, a portion of which are

or have been generated by investment banking activities of RBC Capital Markets and its affiliates.

Other Disclosures

Prepared with the assistance of our national research sources. RBC Wealth Management prepared this report and takes sole responsibility for its content and distribution. The content may have been based, at least in part, on material provided by our third-party correspondent research services. Our third-party correspondent has given RBC Wealth Management general permission to use its research reports as source materials, but has not reviewed or approved this report, nor has it been informed of its publication. Our third-party correspondent may from time to time have long or short positions in, effect transactions in, and make markets in securities referred to herein. Our third-party correspondent may from time to time perform investment banking or other services for, or solicit investment banking or other business from, any company mentioned in this report.

RBC Wealth Management endeavors to make all reasonable efforts to provide research simultaneously to all eligible clients, having regard to local time zones in overseas jurisdictions. In certain investment advisory accounts, RBC Wealth Management or a designated third party will act as overlay manager for our clients and will initiate transactions in the securities referenced herein for those accounts upon receipt of this report. These transactions may occur before or after your receipt of this report and may have a short-term impact on the market price of the securities in which transactions occur. RBC Wealth Management research is posted to our proprietary Web sites to ensure eligible clients receive coverage initiations and changes in rating, targets, and opinions in a timely manner. Additional distribution may be done by sales personnel via e-mail, fax, or regular mail. Clients may also receive our research via third-party vendors. Please contact your RBC Wealth Management Financial Advisor for more information regarding RBC Wealth Management research.

Conflicts Disclosure: RBC Wealth Management is registered with the Securities and Exchange Commission as a broker/dealer and an investment adviser, offering both brokerage and investment advisory services. RBC Wealth Management's Policy for Managing Conflicts of Interest in Relation to Investment Research is available from us on our website at <https://www.rbccm.com/GLDisclosure/PublicWeb/DisclosureLookup.aspx?EntityID=2>. Conflicts of interests related to our investment advisory business can be found in Part 2A Appendix 1 of the Firm's Form ADV or the RBC Advisory Programs Disclosure Document. Copies of any of these documents are available upon request through your Financial Advisor. We reserve the right to amend or supplement this policy, Part 2A Appendix 1 of the Form ADV, or the RBC Advisory Programs Disclosure Document at any time.

The authors are employed by one of the following entities: RBC Wealth Management USA, a division of RBC Capital Markets, LLC, a securities broker-dealer with principal offices located in Minnesota and New York, USA; by RBC Dominion Securities Inc., a securities broker-dealer with principal offices located in Toronto, Canada; by RBC

Investment Services (Asia) Limited, a subsidiary of RBC Dominion Securities Inc., a securities broker-dealer with principal offices located in Hong Kong, China; by Royal Bank of Canada, Singapore Branch, a licensed wholesale bank with its principal office located in Singapore; and by RBC Europe Limited, a licensed bank with principal offices located in London, United Kingdom.

Research Resources

This document is produced by the Global Portfolio Advisory Committee within RBC Wealth Management's Portfolio Advisory Group. The RBC WM Portfolio Advisory Group provides support related to asset allocation and portfolio construction for the firm's Investment Advisors / Financial Advisors who are engaged in assembling portfolios incorporating individual marketable securities. The Committee leverages the broad market outlook as developed by the RBC Investment Strategy Committee, providing additional tactical and thematic support utilizing research from the RBC Investment Strategy Committee, RBC Capital Markets, and third-party resources.

Third-party Disclaimers

The Global Industry Classification Standard ("GICS") was developed by and is the exclusive property and a service mark of MSCI Inc. ("MSCI") and Standard & Poor's Financial Services LLC ("S&P") and is licensed for use by RBC. Neither MSCI, S&P, nor any other party involved in making or compiling the GICS or any GICS classifications makes any express or implied warranties or representations with respect to such standard or classification (or the results to be obtained by the use thereof), and all such parties hereby expressly disclaim all warranties of originality, accuracy, completeness, merchantability and fitness for a particular purpose with respect to any of such standard or classification. Without limiting any of the foregoing, in no event shall MSCI, S&P, any of their affiliates or any third party involved in making or compiling the GICS or any GICS classifications have any liability for any direct, indirect, special, punitive, consequential or any other damages (including lost profits) even if notified of the possibility of such damages.

Disclaimer

The information contained in this report has been compiled by RBC Wealth Management, a division of RBC Capital Markets, LLC, from sources believed to be reliable, but no representation or warranty, express or implied, is made by Royal Bank of Canada, RBC Wealth Management, its affiliates or any other person as to its accuracy, completeness or correctness. All opinions and estimates contained in this report constitute RBC Wealth Management's judgment as of the date of this report, are subject to change without notice and are provided in good faith but without legal responsibility. Past performance is not a guide to future performance, future returns are not guaranteed, and a loss of original capital may occur. Every province in Canada, state in the U.S., and most countries throughout the world have their own laws regulating the types of securities and other investment products which may be offered to their residents, as well as the process for doing so. As a result, the securities discussed in this report may not be eligible for sale in some jurisdictions. This report is not, and under no circumstances should be construed as, a solicitation to act as securities broker or dealer in any jurisdiction by any person or company that is not legally permitted to carry on the business of a securities broker or dealer in that jurisdiction. Nothing in this report constitutes legal, accounting or tax advice or individually tailored investment advice. This material is prepared for general circulation to clients, including clients who are affiliates of Royal Bank of Canada, and does not have regard to the particular circumstances or needs of any specific person who may read it. The investments or services contained in this report may not be suitable for you and it is recommended that

you consult an independent investment advisor if you are in doubt about the suitability of such investments or services. To the full extent permitted by law neither Royal Bank of Canada nor any of its affiliates, nor any other person, accepts any liability whatsoever for any direct, indirect or consequential loss arising from, or in connection with, any use of this report or the information contained herein. No matter contained in this document may be reproduced or copied by any means without the prior written consent of Royal Bank of Canada in each instance. Additional information is available upon request.

To U.S. Residents: This publication has been approved by RBC Capital Markets, LLC, Member NYSE/FINRA/SIPC, which is a U.S. registered broker-dealer and which accepts responsibility for this report and its dissemination in the United States. RBC Capital Markets, LLC, is an indirect wholly-owned subsidiary of the Royal Bank of Canada and, as such, is a related issuer of Royal Bank of Canada. Any U.S. recipient of this report that is not a registered broker-dealer or a bank acting in a broker or dealer capacity and that wishes further information regarding, or to effect any transaction in, any of the securities discussed in this report, should contact and place orders with RBC Capital Markets, LLC. International investing involves risks not typically associated with U.S. investing, including currency fluctuation, foreign taxation, political instability and different accounting standards.

To Canadian Residents: This publication has been approved by RBC Dominion Securities Inc. RBC Dominion Securities Inc.* and Royal Bank of Canada are separate corporate entities which are affiliated. * Member-Canadian Investor Protection Fund. © Registered trademark of Royal Bank of Canada. Used under license. RBC Wealth Management is a registered trademark of Royal Bank of Canada. Used under license.

RBC Wealth Management (British Isles): This publication is distributed by RBC Europe Limited and Royal Bank of Canada (Channel Islands) Limited. RBC Europe Limited is authorised by the Prudential Regulation Authority and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority and the Prudential Regulation Authority (FCA registration number: 124543). Registered office: 100 Bishopsgate, London, EC2N 4AA, UK. Royal Bank of Canada (Channel Islands) Limited is regulated by the Jersey Financial Services Commission in the conduct of investment business in Jersey. Registered office: Gaspé House, 66-72 Esplanade, St Helier, Jersey JE2 3QT, Channel Islands.

To Hong Kong Residents: This publication is distributed in Hong Kong by Royal Bank of Canada, Hong Kong Branch which is regulated by the Hong Kong Monetary Authority and the Securities and Futures Commission ('SFC'), and RBC Investment Services (Asia) Limited, which is regulated by the SFC.

To Singapore Residents: This publication is distributed in Singapore by the Royal Bank of Canada, Singapore Branch, a registered entity licensed by the Monetary Authority of Singapore. This material has been prepared for general circulation and does not take into account the objectives, financial situation, or needs of any recipient. You are advised to seek independent advice from a financial adviser before purchasing any product. If you do not obtain independent advice, you should consider whether the product is suitable for you. Past performance is not indicative of future performance. If you have any questions related to this publication, please contact the Royal Bank of Canada, Singapore Branch. Royal Bank of Canada, Singapore Branch accepts responsibility for this report and its dissemination in Singapore.

© 2023 RBC Capital Markets, LLC – Member NYSE/FINRA/SIPC
© 2023 RBC Dominion Securities Inc. – Member Canadian Investor Protection Fund
© 2023 RBC Europe Limited
© 2023 Royal Bank of Canada
All rights reserved